

ASSET Project number 585587-EPP-1-2017-1-IL-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP An external Evaluation Subcontractor Agreement for ASSET project no. 585587

External Evaluator's Final Report

The Final report includes:

- a summary of the work plan,
- meeting evaluation reports,
- all the evaluation criteria of the deliverables.
- expert's assessment on whether the expected deliverables were delivered.

I - Summary of evaluator's work plan

According to ASSET proposal an external subcontracted evaluator has to monitor the project implementation assessing whether the expected project deliverables were delivered and determine their quality. External evaluator fulfils his task following the Work Plan presented to the Project coordinator on September 26, 2018.

The project activities up to March 2019 and achievements gained by then were followed and assessed in the Mid-term Report that was presented on March 08, 2019 containing also previous CM#2 evaluation report and CM#3 evaluation report.

This Report is based on:

- systematic and periodical analysis of the materials presented and made available in the ASSET Portal,
- monitoring of the MOFFET Meeting and Consortium Meeting of September 08, 2020 both via Zoom,
- communication with the Project Coordinator Prof. Dorit Alt on Skype and via e-mail.

On June 08 2020 during Skype meeting with the project coordinator the situation with the implementation of the planned project activities and measures taken for gaining the project results in the conditions of coronavirus pandemic was discussed in detail.

The External Evaluator was informed about the ways and process of analysing of all data concerning project progress. Producing of handbooks with useful practices from the pilotings of the developed by the project tools, finalisation of the piloting events, organising of the questionnaires analyse. Special effort was done to develop narratives about the activities what have been provided in the participating Israeli and Georgian institutions in the 2019-2020 academic year. Also European institutions were asked to review and suggest their recommendations to raise the quality of the pilots.. The handbooks were reviewed by the external auditor who maded sure that the quality criteria set by the QA team (led by EU members) are all met. Revisions were made according to his comments to insure the improvement of the outputs.

II - Meeting evaluation reports

During the period following the Mid-term report three meetings were arranged with External Evaluator's participation:

- -Train -the-trainer session held in GE HEIs. The external evaluator issued a report following this meeting.
- planned Dissemination Event in Jerusalem was replaced with ASSET final international dissemination on-line conference on July 7 2020



- Final Consortium Meeting on September 08 2020 took place via ZOOM

ASSET final international dissemination conference, July 07 2020

ASSET final international dissemination conference took place online in the frame of the First International Conference on Academic Writing organised in cooperation by IFAW (Israel Forum for Academic Writing), the MOFET Institute, and the Erasmus+ ASSET project (https://www.asseterasmus.com/final-event). The event brought together 800 participants. 25 papers and workshops during this representative international meeting were provided by ASSET members. The External Evaluator followed several presentations of ASSET team-members. The conference was recorded for distributing by MOFET institute to other national and international HEIs.

In External Evaluator's opinion the opportunity to use the capacity of the First International Conference on Academic Writing for disseminating ASSET's outcomes was professionally **very well realised**. This particular had event evidently much stronger international resonance than the originally planned Jerusalem event.

Final Consortium Meeting (CM#5) on September 08 2020 via ZOOM

On the three-hour ASSET final on-line meeting via ZOOM on September 2020 participated 41 people.

The meeting contained the following structural parts:

Introductory of the project coordinator Dorit Alt drawing general conclusions of the ASSET implementation and achievements. The role of each participating institution from Israel, Georgia and European countries was emphasised.

Project coordinator's presentation was followed by the participants' comments and additions.

The main results of the project were exposed by the project coordinator in her PPT presentation introducing ASSET webpage and Handbooks of the methods.

Project coordinator analysed the project outcomes. (The HEI's reports, Tools Reports and full Project Report are available in the portal.) The coordinator drew attention to the fact that usage and assessments of different tools in different HEIs varies strongly. (Students' reflections were presented as examples.) Participants' of the meeting commented the presentation and findings.

Project coordinator explained that after two years there will be follow-up about the tools' sustainability and the participants were asked to keep records for that.

Project coordinator presented the data collected from the teachers. Also by teachers the opinions and ratings to the Tools varied. (SAKH' manager spoke about the need to translate the Tools into Arabic, SAKH will translate ASSET's handbooks.)

The participants marked that the pandemic situation made the usefulness of the Project outcomes - Tools - more valuable. Three laboratories for simulations were established.

The Dissemination report presented the facts more than 9000 website entries and 4 online seminars for 350 participants during pandemic situation. The ASSET portal was main tool for spreading information (materials were uploaded to the portal immediately!), for dissemination of lots of activities, for broadcasts.

The structure of the conclusion-drawing and results presenting ZOOM meeting in the world-wide pandemic situation on September 08 2020 was very well prepared. The different PPT presentations were well targeted, informative in optimal content, allowing to assess the different parts of the project in general. The materials of the Meeting presented on the portal https://www.asset-erasmus.com/final-cm-5.

By the External Evaluator's opinion the final event met fully the goals and aims set to it.



III - evaluation criteria of the quality of the deliverables

Tasks and Deliverables of WP2

Task	Deliverables	Due date
2.2 Train- the-trainer sessions (stated in the application)	 EU experts collaborating with IL/GE ASSET faculty will set up the programs for the Train-the-Trainer workshops. An initial workshop will be used to elaborate a first draft of CAT's training manual. At least 4 faculty per HEI will be trained at EU-hosted course assessment development trainings. The delivery of train-the trainer in second year in both GE and IL. National meetings for peer consultation and sharing best practices and peer mentorship will take place as well resulting in multiplier effect (~10 faculty per HEI). 	15-05-2019
Accomplish ed of 2.2	 IL Train-the-Trainer session (February 18-21, 2019), was used to train the ASSET members to use the CATs and to effectively train other members of their HEIs to use the tools in the piloting phase. The CAT plans were uploaded to the portal before the session. According to the proposal At least 4 faculty per HEI are expected to be trained. To this aim, each workshop was given 2-3 times during the meeting, in 3 different HEIs (GACE, SAKH, KCJV). According to the proposal, at least 4 faculty per HEI were expected to be trained. Yet, the workshops included 175 faculty members from IL HEIs. GE Train-the-Trainer session (May 13-16, 2019), was used to train the ASSET members to use the CATs and to effectively train other members of their HEIs to use the tools in the piloting phase. According to the proposal At least 4 faculty per HEI were expected to be trained. Yet, the workshops included 230 faculty members from GE HEIs. Peer mentorship in IL and GE HEIs. Based on the application, the development WP includes peer mentoring sessions provided by each HEI to its local staff. The aim was to train up to 10 faculty from each HEI (80 in total) in the developed course assessment tools developed by ASSET by focusing on the local needs. A special tool and page on the portal were designed to collect data. Net of practitioners was established at the beginning of the project to provide guidance. A Toolkit for Teachers was available. Based on the report, in practice 193 faculty in total have participated in the peer mentoring sessions. 	15-10-2020
2.4 Piloting of CATs (stated in the application)	 During the academic year 2019-2020 2 to 4 courses will be tested using innovative CATs. Piloting at least 2 courses from previously TEMPUS funded curriculum development projects Preparing an information package for teachers. Updating CATs according to students' needs and alignment of learning outcomes to be achieved. During the piloting phase, there will be national meetings for peer consultation. At the end of the pilot phase CAT's handbooks will be elaborated. 	15-09-2020

Accomplish ed 2.4

- During the academic year 2019-2020 2 to 4 pilots were expected according to the proposal to be conducted in each GE and IL HEIs using the developed CATs. In practice, 116 pilots were conducted.
- · Indicator/output: Pilot questionnaires for teachers and students
- To collect data from teachers and students, two questionnaires purposely designed by ASSET QA team were used.
- Indicator/output:Special area on the portal for data collection
- A special area on the portal was designated to communicate all the information regarding the pilots with the members.
- Indicator/output: Narrations of best practices criteria
- Net of Practitioners area continued to be available during pilots. The developed teachers manuals continued to serve the teachers during the piloting process and were available online.
- Indicator/output: Narrations of best practices inserted in ASSET final handbooks of good practices
- Teachers were asked to narrate 1-2 best practiced pilots in each HEI (according to criteria provided by QA team). These descriptions when inserted into ASSET final booklets (which included also the teacher manuals).
- <u>Indicator/output:</u> Pilot results QA report on students (quantitative data)
- The targeted number of participants in the application was 1000. Thus, more than twice this number has been reached through our survey in our pilots. We can actually state that more students actually participated in the pilots that the survey results reflect. According to the application, 2 4 pilots should have been conducted in each HEI (a total of 36 max). In practice, each HEI has conducted more than 4 pilots and a total of 116 pilots were carried out by the consortium (IL and GE). All of ASSET's tools were piloted
- <u>Indicator/output:</u> Pilot results QA report on sample of students' quotes. Qualitative data
- The targeted number of participants in the application was 1000. Thus, more than twice this number has been reached through our survey in our pilots. We can actually state that more students actually participated in the pilots that the survey results reflect. According to the application, 2 4 pilots should have been conducted in each HEI (a total of 36 max). In practice, each HEI has conducted more than 4 pilots and a total of 116 pilots were carried out by the consortium (IL and GE). All of ASSET's tools were piloted
- <u>Indicator/output:</u> Pilot results QA report on teachers (quantitative data)
- 126 faculty conducted the pilots (The targeted number of faculty participants was 2-4 in the application).
- <u>Indicator/output:</u> Pilot results QA report on teachers (qualitative data)

2.5. National meetings, EU evaluation of pilots



Accomplish ed 2.5	 Second national meetings outcomes are provided above (see 2.1.3; 2.1.4). During the pandemic – alternative ways of communication channels were used – such as zoom discussions, phone calls for peer consultation, sharing best practices and peer mentorship. An additional CM was planned. In which EU partners were supposed to give feedback to GE and IL pilots which were conducted in the first semester of 2019. Although pre-authorized (as it was not on the application) this CM was cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions. Nonetheless, each GE and IL HEI sent 1-4 pilot narrations (20 in total) for EU partners' review. Each EU partner received 5 narrations, and suggested comments (tips and tops i.e. pros and cons) to the GE and IL partners. After receiving the reviews, the GE and IL HEIs were requested to address the comments and provide ways in which the pilots can be improved. 	
2.6. Handbooks		10-2020
Accomplish ed 2.6	ASSET's handbooks (teacher manuals) were elaborated. Information is provided about the lessons learned and observed and impact generated on teachers and students alike, and best practices gained. The handbooks are available in English, and were also translated to Arabic and Georgian.	

Changes that have occurred in this result since the original proposal:

- 1. An additional CM was planned. In which EU partners were supposed to give feedback to GE and IL pilots which were conducted in the first semester of 2019. Although pre-authorized (as it was not on the application) this CM was cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions. Nonetheless, each GE and IL HEI sent 1-4 pilot narrations (20 in total) for EU partners' review. Each EU partner received 5 narrations, and suggested comments (tips and tops i.e. pros and cons) to the GE and IL partners.
- 2. After receiving the reviews, the GE and IL HEIs were requested to address the comments and provide ways in which the pilots can be improved.

Tasks and Deliverables of WP3

Task	Deliverables	Due date
3.2 Internal review self and peer review. (stated in the application)	 In second and third year internal review reports will be elaborated and posted in the project intranet. 	15-03- 2020
Accomplishment of 3.2	 EU partners' evaluation of pilots – report, including GE and IL proposed revisions based on EU members' comments. EU partners' review and analysis (mapping) of CATs (ASSET developed tools) used by GE and IL was provided at the end of the project. 	



3.4 Appling Evaluation tools, collecting and summarizing data. (stated in the application)	In the third year, during the piloting phase questionnaires, interviews, focus groups will be carried out.	30-06- 2020
Accomplishment of 3.4	 To evaluate ASSET CM meetings and activities, the measurements developed by the QA team were used to gather data from the participants. Data were analyzed by the external evaluator and the QA team. The reports were uploaded to the portal. 3.4.5 CM#4 Train the trainers in GE: QA team report on - 16.5. 2019 last day management meeting 3.4.6 CM#4 Train the trainers in GE: QA team report on train the trainers workshops 3.4.7 Peer mentoring sessions PMS QA report 3.4.8 Pilot results – QA report on students (quantitative data) 3.4.9 Pilot results - QA report on teachers (quantitative data) 3.4.10 Pilot results – QA report on teachers (quantitative data) 3.4.11 Pilot results - QA analysis report on teachers qualitative data 	
3.5 External review and report by EU ASSET partners (stated in the application)	 An external subcontracted evaluator will monitor the project implementation. This will be approved by the Steering Committee at the beginning of the project. A Final eport is expected by the end of the third year. Likewise, ASSET partners will submit annual reports on QA results according to the framework for quality plan. 	14-10- 2020
Accomplishment of 3.5	 Government (Israeli Council on Higher Education and Georgian Ministry of Education) Reports were provided. An external subcontracted evaluator has monitored the project implementation since August 2018 to September 2020 meeting in Zoom. The present Final report is delivered. 	

Tasks and Deliverables of WP4

Task	Deliverables	Due date
4.1 Dissemination within ASSETS Consortium and online and social-Professional Networking (stated in the application)	Dissemination through internal meetings, seminars and workshops. Likewise, online and socio-professional networking.	14-10-2020



Accomplishment of 4.1	 Dissemination through internal meetings, seminars and workshops, online and socio-professional networking has taken and taking place on institutional and national level and also on international platforms (information accessible from the ASSET's mid-term report). In the Blog on the ASSET Portal there are 17 posts uploaded from October 2017 to January 2019. In the Net of the Practitioners there are 47 posts and 521 views ASSET Dissemination materials ASSET Dissemination activities and plan ASSET Facebook 	
4.2 Dissemination through ASSET's Website (stated in the application)	 KCJV will develop a project website where activities and announcement on course assessment developments undertaken during the project will be posted there. The non-educational organization (NTCPD) will provide significant press and publicity work in favor of the project 	14-10-2020
Accomplishment of 4.2	KCJV has developed a project website where activities and announcement on course assessment developments undertaken during the project are posted. By the end of the Midterm reporting the ASSET Portal has the sub-divisions: Home Net of Practitioners Preparation Reports Development QP Dissemination Blog The non-educational organisation (NTCPD) will provide significant press and publicity work in favour of the project. NTCPD in responsible for all the GE HEIs diss activities — among them also press releases www.asset-erasmus.com	
4.3 Dissemination to other HEIs and multiplier workshops and faculty training in IL and GE by partner NGOs (stated in the application)	 During the second and third year, partner country HEIs will organise workshops and open days dedicated to invite faculty staff from other HEIs not directly involved in the project and present them with the project activities and results on CATs and impact on student performance. 	14-10-2020



Accomplishment of 4.3	 Dissemination events including faculty staff from other HEIs not directly involved in the project were held in GE and IL, three special events up till now. In GE the National Center for Teacher Professional Development NCTPD has supported the events, the Center for the Advancement of Teaching has collaborated and participated in the KCJV event and planned events. The train-the-trainers session in IL and GE were enhanced to include not only ASSET team members (the trainers) but also additional 10- 20 faculty members from each HEI, and faculty from HEIs who are not part of ASSET consortium. By doing so, the sessions were used for dissemination purposes above their original objective (i.e., training the trainers). 	
4.4 Participation and/or Organization of round tables, symposiums, national and international conferences in IL and GE (stated in the application)	 At least 3 round tables/symposia/paper/poster presentations in conferences will occur during the second and third year. Whenever possible national project management meetings will coincide with these events. 	14-10-2020



Accomplishment of 4.4	 ASSET members' participation at national and international conferences and symposium is covered in the EXCEL table that summarizes the activities and the visual list of activities seen on the portal: Exemplary events where ASSET was disseminated to other non-project HEIs: EARLI-SIG 13 and InZentIM Conference Essen University, Germany Cluster Seminar on the topic of "Quality Assurance in international academic Projects and beyond", Van-Leer institute A seminar The School of Professional Studies MOFET institute A seminar The School of Professional Studies MOFET institute Social work department faculty - The Max Stern Yezreel Valley academic college. Planned activities: 2019 Association for Israeli Studies (AIS) international conference (IL) Mofet institute conference, IL EARLI international conference, RWTH Aachen, Germany International symposium on teaching, education and learning, Waseda University, Yakyo, Japan. Dissemination event held by NCTPD for representatives of involved HEI and other pedagogical society members, like teachers, teacher, trainers, school principals. Event duration - 3 hours; event topic - tools of formative assessment elaborated by ASSET team. Event conducted by HEI-GE project members. Dissemination of Erasmus+ projects. Sokhumi State University, in the dissemination event will be participated project and non-project Georgian leading universities, Schools and NGOs. Publication in local, national and international levels (SSU). Annual Scientific Conferences of students of Sokhumi State University.Annual Scientific Conference of Academic Staff of Sokhumi State University. The continous update dissemination report was accessible on the portal – i.e. Excel form, alongside a visual report with photos attached. The consortium sent materials to HAC and NCTPD managers, the materials were uploaded to the portal on regular bases according to the approved dissemina	
4.5 Elaboration of handbooks with best practices and lessons learned from the project (stated in the application)	 The complete project will be disseminated in a report containing best practices from project implementation, assessment results, recommendations and suggestions. They will be printed and distributed free of charge at the end of the project and available online. 	14-10-2020
Accomplishment of 4.5	ASSET dissemination materials and handbooks were uploaded to the Erasmus+ beneficiary's area.	

4.6 Final Consortium Meeting and International Conference for Worldwide dissemination (stated in the application)	 A final dissemination event will take place in Jerusalem. The impact of course assessment and other thematic areas in teaching/learning processes will be covered during the Conference. 	30-08-2020
Accomplishment of 4.6	 Due to the Coronavirus pandemia situation the planned Dissemination Event in Jerusalem was replaced with ASSET final international dissemination ONLINE conference with 800 participants. About 100 presentations on Zoom – almost 300 of them were from 55 different countries around the world. 25 Papers and workshops were provided by ASSET members. The conference was recorded and will be further distributed by MOFET institute to other national and international HEIs. 	

Changes that have occurred in this result since the original proposal:

- 1. The train-the-trainers sessions in GE and IL were enhanced to include not only ASSET team members 4 from each HEI (the trainers) but also additional 10 -20 faculty member from each HEI, and faculty from other HEIs who are non-consortium members. By doing so, the sessions were used for dissemination purposes above their original objective (i.e., training the trainers).
- 2. Final dissemination (international) event was supposed to take place in Jerusalem by the end of the project. However, due to COVID-19 restrictions, the event was successfully conducted online.

Task	Deliverables	Due date
5.2 Management of Program and preparation of midterm/ final reports (stated in the application)		10-2020
Accomplishmnent of 5.2	 Second field monitoring in IL report Second field monitoring in GE report CM#5 materials External evaluator's final report 	



IV - External Evaluator's assessment on whether the expected deliverables were delivered at a proper quality level (based on well-defined criteria, approved by the external evaluator).

External Evaluator monitored the project implementation since July 2018 assessing whether the expected project deliverables were adequately delivered based on well-defined criteria using:

- communication with the Project Coordinator Dorit Alt via e-mail and during the Consortium Meetings,
- participating the Consortium Meetings,
- oral and e-mail communication with the ASSET participants on the Consortium Meetings,
- systematic and periodical analysis of the materials presented and made available in the ASSET Portal.

The information and evidence gathered allows the External Evaluator to make a conclusion, that all the project goals and aims by the Work Packages foreseen by LFM were reached (despite the emergency pandemic situation in spring/summer 2020). Professional criteria set by the QA team (led by EU partners and reviewed by the external evaluator) were fully met.

By Work Packages:

WP1 (Preparation: Establishment of framework for development of course assessment strategies in GE and IL)

Indicator of achievement for WP1 was number of CATs identified and selected for IL&GE HEI. General Framework Plan summarizing existing CAT and planning for new CATs for courses was developed, <u>six CATs were identified</u> and selected for Israeli and Georgian HEI-s. **Goal of WP1 was fully reached and in a good quality:** fulfilment of WP1 enabled the following progress of the project and implementation of the next Work Packages with expected results and outcomes.

External Evaluator's decision is based on his observations and information documented in https://www.asset-erasmus.com/preparation.

WP2 (Development of course assessment tools)

Indicators of achievement for WP2 were:

- WP2.1 Number of CATs adapted to courses.
- WP2.2 Number of train the trainers workshops and participants. Number of mentoring sessions.
- WP2.3 ASSET online platform in use by consortium.
- WP2.4 Number of piloted CATs. Number of teachers students participating.

Six different CATs were <u>dynamically developed</u> and elaborated taking into consideration recommendations of project participants, QA criteria and external evaluator's comments. The final versions of all six Tools that were checked on planned train the trainers workshops and mentoring sessions for introducing the CATs.

All six CATs are in their final versions are of **high quality, based on pre-defined criteria set by the QA team.** As well in a **very good** way were carried out the train-the-trainers workshops that were observed by the External Evaluator.

ASSET online platform appears to be built up, updated and maintained **especially well** - design of the webpage presenting the progress of the project of such a large international consortium allows its cumulative development, good up-datedness and easy usability which is all proved by high number of visits.

Established numbers of CAT-s pilotings with quantities of participating students were met and exceeded that allows to gather from the reports of the pilotings information about the effectiveness and quality of the piloted Tools. The reports of pilots present variable ratings to different Tools given by the learners of different HEIs that is normal taking into account the variety of students' disciplines and profiles of the institutions. Overall opinion of the learners about each tested Tool is positive.

External Evaluator's decision is that all expected deliverables of WP2 were delivered and the quality of each achievement is very good.

This decision is based on personal observations during monitored consortium meetings, participants' interviews and information documented in and gathered from the ASSET rich portal (https://www.asseterasmus.com/development).



WP 3 (Quality monitoring and control of the ASSET project)

Indicators of achievement for WP3 are written evaluations of outputs and outcomes from internal and external specialists.

By the end of the project (September 2020) on the webpage https://www.asset-erasmus.com/qp there are 22 links to different Consortium Meetings' reports, External Evaluator's reports, mentoring and field monitoring reports and pilot results. The documentation covers systematically the entire project period and enables to get full overview about the following to each-other steps of the project. By the External Evaluator's monitoring the remarks and other information containing in the different reports were negotiated among the project team-members throughout the project period and were taken into account. Careful and thorough work of the ASSET team with the quality monitoring and control documents is one of the reasons for the successful outcome of the entire project.

External Evaluator's decision is that all **expected deliverables of WP3 were delivered on a high-quality level**.

WP 4 (Dissemination & Exploitation)

Indicators of achievement for WP4 are ASSET HEI and media publications, number of web visitors; number of dissemination events and participants, handbooks printed and downloaded, number of articles written.

Dissemination has taken place throughout the project period within ASSET's Consortium, online and social-professional networking, through ASSET's Website, Dissemination to other HEIs and multiplier workshops and faculty training in Israel and Georgia by partner NGOs, by participation and/or Organization of round tables, symposiums, national and international conferences in Israel, by elaboration of handbooks with the best practices and lessons learned from the project, and on the First International Conference on Academic Writing used for ASSET dissemination in July 2020. The rich dissemination practices are well documented (https://www.asset-erasmus.com/dissemination). External Evaluator's decision is that all expected deliverables of WP4 were delivered wide spread and in a very good quality.

WP 5 (Management)

Indicators of achievement for WP5 are Progress reports and monitoring reports from NEO and EACEA. In terms of management, the First International Conference on Academic Writing in Jerusalem used by ASSET team in July 2020 as dissemination event and Final Consortium Meeting (CM#5) in September 2020 were managed amidst the Coronavirus pandemic situation. Those two major final events succeeded fully, that is the evidence of high-quality management capacities and practices of the ASSET team and affiliated persons.

External Evaluator's decision is that all expected deliverables of WP5 were delivered.

In conclusion: the management of the demanding and rather complicated international project ASSET was performed highly professionally. This judgement is supported by the fact that all the expected deliverables of all of the Work Packages were delivered in time, in good quality and are accessible for everybody on the well-built and easily accessible ASSET portal.

Sulev Valdmaa

ASSET External Evaluator

September 21, 2020